



Integration of a gender dimension in the Sector Budget Support for Decentralised Agriculture in Rwanda

FfGE ILO/ITC

Nathalie Holvoet, Institute of Development Policy and Management,
University of Antwerp

Kigali, June 2012

Outline

1. Aim & method of the workshop (session 1)
2. Background (sessions 1-2)
 - 2.1. Gender mainstreaming in the agricultural sector
 - 2.2. Gender mainstreaming in changing aid modalities
 - 2.3. EC's gender mainstreaming obligations
3. Actual degree of gender mainstreaming (sessions 2-3)
 - 3.1. Sector Budget Support for Decentralised Agriculture
 - 3.2. Rwanda's agricultural sector
4. How to improve gender mainstreaming? (session 3-4-5-6)
 - 4.1. General overview
 - 4.2. Programming/identification/formulation
 - 4.3. Financing/implementation/M&E
 - 4.4. Specific 'pilot' projects

1. Aim & method of the workshop

- To ensure that programme stakeholders speak a common gender language and are able to engage in a gender mainstreaming (GM) strategy for the sector.
- To help stakeholders self-assess their internal strengths and challenges with regards to GM in SBSP Agriculture.
- To facilitate the development of a results-based action plan to mainstream gender in the sector.
- To start a capacity building process among selected stakeholders, which may be pursued and supported in the future through other project or external resources, as relevant

1. Aim & method of the workshop (cont.)

- Lecturing
 - based on review of GM & aid literature
 - based on documentary review related to specific case at hand (gender, EU, budget support, agriculture sector, Rwanda)
- Discussion (during lectures)
 - fine-tuning preliminary gender review of SBSP
 - fine-tuning & testing entry points & tools for GM
- Exercises & feedback & group discussion
 - own identification of strengths & weaknesses of gender-sensitivity of SBSP
 - own identification of feasible entry-points & tools

2. Background

2.1. Gender mainstreaming in the agricultural sector

2.2. Gender mainstreaming in changing aid modalities

2.3. EC's gender mainstreaming obligations

2.1. Gender mainstreaming in the agricultural sector

- Gender equality generally not well integrated in agricultural sector policies/programmes, while:
 - women play an essential role in agriculture
 - their access to and control over productive resources is limited
 - lack of attention poses a threat to effectiveness of the agricultural development agenda and MDG's (especially MDG 1)

- Governance reforms relevant for agriculture are gender sensitive if they are:
 - sensitive to gender differentials
 - gender-specific
 - empowering to women
 - transformative

2.1. GM in agricultural sector (cont)

- A gender dimension should be mainstreamed in all phases of an agricultural programme: analysis, programming/ formulation, budgeting and implementation and M&E:

Phase	Gender equality perspective
Analysis	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Identification of different take-off positions and priorities -Identification of the key gender issues in the agricultural sector -Analysis of the degree to which these gender key issues are addressed in the agricultural policy -Analysis of existing capacity for gender mainstreaming and - budgeting -Analysis of commitments and incentives
Programming/ formulation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Formulation of gender-specific programmes/ projects and mainstreaming in other agricultural programmes/ projects -Identification of capacity building programmes -Identification of sex-disaggregated and gender equality indicators
Budgeting and implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Allocation of budgets to gender-specific programmes/ projects -Integration of gender dimension in results-based management and budgeting
Monitoring and evaluation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Integration of gender dimension in joint budget reviews, joint sector reviews, performance assessment frameworks, sector working groups and (joint) evaluations

2.2. Gender mainstreaming in changing aid modalities

- shifts in aid modalities
 - projects, programmes, general & sector budget support
 - portfolio approaches

- Paris Declaration: reform agenda around 5 key-principles

- gender dimension in aid effectiveness agenda
 - largely neglected in PD
 - absent from the 12 monitoring indicators
 - absent from major evaluation efforts
 - slight improvement in AAA & Bhusan Partnership
 - DAC Guiding Principles for Aid Effectiveness, Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment (December 2008)
 - (optional) assessment on 3 gender equality performance indicators in 2011 survey

2.2. GM in changing aid modalities (cont)

- no unequivocal position on expected effects of PD/AAA on gender equality & women's empowerment
 - consensus: PD/AAA key-principles entail opportunities & challenges



(see annex 1)

2.2. GM in 'new' aid modalities (cont)

➤ changing division of responsibilities

- leadership for integration of gender dimension in sector policies and processes in hands of partner country
 - gender actors within and outside the ministry
 - key-actors involved in national & sector policy, implementation, M&E

- and what about donors ?

- and the EC in particular ?

→ 10 minutes discussion in pairs + discussion in group

2.2. GM in 'new' aid modalities (cont)

- donors: harmonise & align but donor responsibility for GM remains
 - different donor entry points:
 - diagnosis of country policies and systems
 - policy dialogue
 - capacity building of actors inside & outside government
 - performance assessment frameworks (PAF)
 - joint (sector) working groups
 - monitoring exercises like joint (sector) reviews
 - well-aligned pilot projects

- changes needed in donor agencies

2.2. GM in changing aid modalities (cont.)

➤ changes needed in donor agencies

■ commitment

- EU Plan of Action on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in Development

■ capacity

- elaboration of tools and instruments for ↑ gender-sensitivity
- gender training of EU staff
- training of gender focal points
- GRB tools and approaches are useful: bridging function between gender experts and PFM/ macroeconomic/ budget support experts

BUT

- mandates of gender focal points should not only be project-based
- position of gender focal points should be higher in hierarchy

2.2. GM in changing aid modalities (cont.)

➤ changes needed in donor agencies

▪ Incentives

- need for clear-cut system of sticks and carrots ->
 - inclusion of gender indicators in PAF of donor's performance
 - use of indicators & targets in the EU Gender Action Plan & annual review
- international incentives
 - G-marker
 - DAC peer review

2.3. EC's gender mainstreaming obligations

Phase	What has to be done already	What has to be done in the near future
Programming phase		Gender Country Profile (from next CSP and NIP onwards) (Gender Action Plan: 13)
Identification	Gender Equality Screening Checklist (GESCi) (compulsory since 2010 for new projects)	
Formulation	Gender Equality Screening Checklist (GESCF) (compulsory since 2010 for new projects)	By 2015 Gender Equality Policy Marker have to be applied to at least 80% of all EU projects (Gender Action Plan: 15)
		By 2014/15 at least 80% of financing proposals for sector budget support include gender-sensitive indicators (Gender Action Plan: 14)
Monitoring	EU participates in all existing Gender Coordination Groups in developing countries (by 2012) (Gender Action Plan: 13)	By 2013 at least 80% of all annual reviews include a gender analysis (Gender Action Plan: 13)
	Gender issues feature on the agenda of sector/ macro policy dialogue where relevant (by 2011) (Gender Action Plan: 14)	By 2013 gender is on the agenda in at least one annual dialogue (gender policy forum) with civil society in each country (Gender Action Plan: 14)

3. Actual degree of gender mainstreaming

3.1. EU Sector Budget Support for Decentralised Agriculture

3.2. Rwanda's agricultural sector

3.1. Gender mainstreaming in SBS for Decentralised Agriculture

➤ Assignment 1

- Discuss in pairs the present level of GM in the SBS programme for Decentralised Agriculture in Rwanda
- Identify strong & weak points as well as opportunities & threats
- Discussion in group + distribution of trainer's assessment on basis of available documents (**handout 1**)

3.2. Gender mainstreaming in Rwanda's agricultural sector

- Gender in the PSTA II (see also **handout 2**)
 - 3 specific gender related actions: 0.6% of total budget
 - gender friendly crops and livestock
 - training of women's farming organisations
 - development of a sector-wide gender strategy
 - gender sensitive actions: 6.9% of total budget
 - 11 gender output indicators
- + see also gender review in Agriculture Gender Strategy
- Agriculture Gender Strategy (2010)
 - costing strategy and development of a gender responsive M&E framework in November 2011
 - launched in March 2012
 - a gender coordinator (still to be hired) will coordinate the implementation
 - the gender subsector working group will guide the implementation

3.2. Gender mainstreaming in Rwanda's agricultural sector (cont)

- Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB)
 - MINAGRI pilot in national GRB initiative
 - Gender budget statement for financial year 2010/11: 14 activities in 2 PSTA II programmes with a total budget of 11 billion RwF (13.8 million euro)
 - MINAGRI focus of UN Women's programme on 'Integrating Gender Responsive Budgeting in the Aid Effectiveness Agenda'
 - Support to umbrella of community based CSOs (CCOAIB)
 - MINAGRI focus of the Gender Monitoring Office's 'Programme on Gender and Democratic Governance'
 - May 2011: training in gender analysis, planning and budgeting and gender responsive service delivery and M&E for MINAGRI staff and affiliated agencies and projects
 - Gender Equitable Local Development (GELD)
 - GRB at district level

4. How to improve gender mainstreaming of the SBSP?

- 4.1. General Overview (handout)
- 4.2. Programming, identification, formulation
- 4.3. Financing, implementation, M&E
- 4.4. Specific (joint) projects

4. How to improve gender mainstreaming?

4.1. general overview of different entry points and suggested tools and checklists : handout 3

4. How to improve gender mainstreaming?

4.2. Programming/ identification/ formulation phases: overview

Donor entry point: Integration of gender dimension in existing diagnosis instruments	Tools and Checklists (suggestions)
<p>Gender Scan of National/Sector Policies & Systems</p> <p><u>National (central) level</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Verify whether and how a gender dimension is integrated into national policies and systems ▪ Verify the existing national gender policy ▪ Verify the presence and quality of the existing national gender apparatus (central + focal points) <p><u>Sector level</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Verify whether and how a gender dimension is integrated in sector policies and systems ▪ Verify the presence and quality of the existing gender apparatus at sector level 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Country Gender Profile - Gender Equality Screening Checklist for GBS - Gender Equality Policy Marker - OECD/DAC Paris Declaration gender performance indicators <p>- Gender sensitive assessment of the seven key sector areas (use of Gender Toolkit 5.1)</p>
<p>Gender Scan of Non-Governmental Actors</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Map and assess the capacity of the national gender demand side ▪ Assess the extent to which the national gender demand side is involved in national and sector processes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Country Gender Profile - OECD/DAC Paris Declaration gender performance 'mutual accountability' indicator - Gender sensitive assessment of key sector areas

4.2. Programming, identification, formulation: integration of gender dimension in existing diagnosis instruments

A. Gender Scan of **National**/Sector Policies & Systems

1. **Country Gender Profile** (compulsory in next generation of CSP and NIP)

- verification of integration of gender dimension in national/sector policies & systems
- verification of integration of gender policies in national/sector development policies and plans
- verification of presence/ quality of gender apparatus
- useful format: OECD/DAC gender performance indicators ('ownership', 'managing for results' and 'mutual accountability')

→ jointly + check also existing sources (WB gender assessment, ADB gender assessment, analysis/diagnosis in Gender Agricultural Strategy, ...)

2. **Gender Equality Screening Checklist for GBS**

3. **Application of the Gender Equality Policy Marker** (compulsory)

- G-0: gender equality is not targeted
- G-1: gender equality is a significant objective
- G-2: gender equality is a principle objective

4.2. Programming, identification, formulation: integration of gender dimension in existing diagnosis instruments (cont.)

A. Gender Scan of National/Sector** Policies and Systems (cont.)**

4. Gender sensitive assessment of the seven key sector areas (use of Gender Toolkit 5.1)

Assignment 2: discuss in groups which questions could be asked in each key area in order to make the assessment more gender sensitive (each group one or two key areas)

→ see handout 4 for some examples of questions

→ see handout 5 for an overview of possible questions

Assignment 3: discuss in groups possible answers to these questions (each group one or two key areas)

4.2. Programming/ identification/ formulation phases: integration of gender dimension in existing diagnosis instruments (cont.)

B. Gender Scan of national/sector non-government actors

1. Country Gender Profile

- mapping and assessment of the capacity of national gender demand side
- assessment of involvement national gender demand side in PRSP and sector program processes
- useful format: OECD/DAC gender performance 'mutual accountability' indicator

2. Gender-sensitive assessment of key area 5

4. How to improve gender mainstreaming? (cont)

4.3. Financing, implementation, monitoring and evaluation phases: overview

Donor entry points	Tools and Checklists (suggestions)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Integration of gender dimension in financing instruments 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Integration of gender indicators in variable tranche - Tools and instruments of gender-responsive budgeting
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Inclusion of gender dimension in existing capacity strengthening efforts (e.g. in the area of PFM) to increase the gender expertise of (non-gender) sector staff - Organisation of a gender coordination / working group - Inclusion of gender issues in other (sector) working groups - Discussion of gender issues in policy dialogue - Gender indicators in PAFs and joint sector reviews - Gender dimension in implementation and monitoring report and Background Conclusion Sheet (BCS) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Tools and instruments of gender-responsive budgeting - List of possible gender indicators for the agricultural sector
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Gender dimension in (joint) evaluative exercises 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Tools and instruments of gender-responsive budgeting

4.3. Financing, implementation, monitoring and evaluation phases

➤ Gender-responsive budgeting

- “gender budgeting is an application of gender mainstreaming in the budgetary process. It means a gender-based assessment of budgets, incorporating a gender perspective at all levels of the budgetary process and restructuring revenues and expenditures in order to promote gender equality” (Group of specialists on gender budgeting, Council of Europe, 2005)

- Key elements
 - gender mainstreaming
 - different phases of the budget (and policy) cycle (financial and real)
 - content and processes
 - analysis and action
 - wide variety of initiatives (no blueprint)
 - limitations (‘realistic expectations’)

➤ Gender-responsive budgeting (cont.)

- usefulness of gender budgeting in context of changing aid modalities
 - a number of similar principles
 - confrontation of inputs and results (results-orientation & performance-based)
 - accountability and transparency (good governance)
 - underlying budgetary processes: 'inclusiveness' (see principles of 'participation', broad-based country ownership)
 - bridging mechanism between gender & non-gender experts
 - particularly useful for making national/sector policies and systems more gender-sensitive
 - capacity building of national/sector actors in GRB (see also 4.4.)
 - useful for national non-state actors & for donors

➤ Gender Responsive Budgeting (cont.)

- General GRB approaches
 - Budlender and Sharp 3 categories approach (see a.o. Budlender and Sharp, 1998)
 - Elson's Budget Cycle Framework (see Elson, 2002)

- GRB Tools (see a.o. Hewitt, 2002)
 - gender-aware policy appraisal
 - gender-disaggregated beneficiary assessment
 - gender-aware macro-economic models (see Cagatay, Elson and Grown, 1995)
 - gender-aware MTEF
 - gender-disaggregated benefit incidence analysis (see Demery, 2002)
 - gender-disaggregated revenue incidence analysis (see Himmelweit, 2002a;2002b)
 - gender-disaggregated analysis of impact of the budget on time use
 - gender-aware budget statement

4.3. Financing, implementation & M&E phase (cont.)

➤ Policy Dialogue

- dialogue content: general characteristics & implications for GM

-depends on phase in GBS cycle but

-later phases depend on earlier phases

- national policies and policy matrixes → **performance criteria & indicators** → dialogue
- avoid gender retrofitting

-focus on policy and on systems

-evidence-based

- **monitoring & evaluation (M&E)** at different phases feeds into dialogue content
 - ✓ ex-ante: joint diagnosis
 - ✓ ex-nunc: joint review
 - ✓ ex-post: joint audit & evaluations
- mutually reinforcing relationship between M&E and dialogue
 - ✓ M&E evidence → ↑ quality dialogue
 - ✓ dialogue → ↑ M&E feedback & use

➤ Policy dialogue (cont.)

- Dialogue process
 - mapping of possible interlocuteurs (state & non-state) early on

 - need for harmonisation & team work
 - among donors
 - within aid agency
 - ✓ within delegations
 - ✓ between delegations & HQ

4.3. Financing, implementation, M&E (cont.)

➤ monitoring and evaluation

- gender indicators in PAFs (variable tranche & fixed tranches//base & performance tranches)
 - crucial for inclusion in joint (sector) review & **policy dialogue**
 - select indicators from country's own matrices (consensual conditionalities)
 - 11 output indicators in PSTA II (see handout 2)
 - no results indicators for inclusion in variable tranche (still focus on results indicators in future??)
 - gender-disaggregation of existing indicators in variable tranche
 - list of possible indicators agricultural sector (**handout 6**) + see also GAS + GMO baseline analysis
- gender in sector coordination & monitoring instruments
 - need for leadership & harmonisation (lead donor?)
 - specific agriculture sector gender working group
 - use of division of labour for inclusion in other sector working groups

➤ monitoring and evaluation (cont.)

▪ gender in evaluation:

-dependent variable

- unveil effects of sector budget support on gender equality & women's empowerment
- use of GRB tools & instruments such as gender-disaggregated benefit incidence analysis, gender-disaggregated impact on time use, etc.

-independent variable

- gender-blindness as possible causal factor for not reaching the expected results of the sector budget support programme

▪ gender expertise in evaluation team

4. How to improve gender mainstreaming? (cont)

4.4. (joint) specific projects

Donor entry points	Tools and Checklists (suggestions)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Capacity strengthening of (sector) government gender apparatus - Capacity strengthening of national (gender) demand side 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Tools and instruments of gender-responsive budgeting (these might be useful to bridge the gap between gender and non-gender experts)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Innovative projects specifically targeted at gender equality and women's empowerment in order to redress the existing unequal take-off positions of men and women 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Gender Equality Screening Checklist for projects - Gender Equality Policy Marker (G=2)

4.4. Specific (joint) projects

- Capacity building (minagri + implementation level)
 - identification of needs (see also Agricultural Gender Strategy)
 - mapping of what already exists in agricultural sector (see 3.2.)
 - coordination through joint sector working groups
 - GRB useful for gender & non-gender experts, for inside & outside government actors

- GEWE innovative pilot projects
 - align to gender-specific projects that exist already in agricultural sector + gender agricultural strategy (see 3.2)
 - particularly useful in portfolio approach
 - link with thematic calls for proposals (EIDHR)



Thank you!



nathalie.holvoet@ua.ac.be



Annex 1: PD through a gender lens: opportunities & challenges (1)

Key-principles	Opportunities	Challenges
Ownership	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -↑ effective implementation of policies -most countries have national gender plans & apparatus 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -misused as excuse to abandon responsibility -national gender policies often marginalised -national gender apparatus often weak
Harmonisation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -clarification of notions -reduction of confusion -joint analytical work -harmonise programming and funding for gender equality and empowerment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -gender concerns sidelined to reach consensus -harmonisation towards the lower end -sectoral focus > horizontal issues

Annex 1: PD through a gender lens: opportunities & challenges (2)

Key-principles	Opportunities	Challenges
<p>Alignment</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -↑ gender mainstreaming through influence and dialogue at the overall sector & macrolevel (↔ projects) -integration of gender perspective in BS entry points <ul style="list-style-type: none"> .policy dialogue .appraisal and monitoring of quality of national plans and processes and systems .capacity building .M&E exercises (joint reviews, etc.) -room for 'gender equality' & empowerment projects (agenda-setting track) in portfolio approaches 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -uncritical alignment to gender-blind policies & processes -curtailing of donor's agenda-setting 'gender equality' & 'empowerment' track

Annex 1: PD through a gender lens: opportunities & challenges (3)

Key-principles	Opportunities	Challenges
<p>Management for development results</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -collection of evidence about results -focus on targets diminishes policy evaporation -analysis of failing development results could identify gender-blindness as a causal factor -similarities among results-oriented budgeting and gender budgeting 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -‘gender equality’ and ‘women’s empowerment’ often not captured in targets -indicatorism and lack of analysis of failing results -‘management for results’ often misinterpreted as ‘management by results’ -reductionist focus on gender equality in education -lack of (use) of sex-disaggregated data
<p>Mutual accountability</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -assessment of gender-sensitivity of donor practices -participation of non-state gender actors in accountability and review exercises -use of gender budgeting as accountability instrument 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -accountability reduced to a narrow interpretation of aid effectiveness -absence of a strong gender demand side among non-state actors